



## Tax Aware

---

# Direct Indexing and the Proposed Biden Tax Plan

June 9, 2021

There are two basic ways to invest in a stock market index: you can buy an index fund, or you can directly buy a stock portfolio that tracks the index. If you are a taxable investor, a benefit of the direct approach is that you can harvest losses on individual positions. But how high are those benefits—and what happens to them under the proposed Biden Tax Plan?

Our [new paper](#) takes a look at this by digging into three important questions:

- 1) What kinds of investors are most likely to benefit from direct indexing?
- 2) How well do these benefits hold up over time?
- 3) What would the proposed Biden Tax Plan<sup>1</sup> mean for their efficacy?

*“Investors with regular short-term gains from their other investments are likely to derive the biggest benefit from direct indexing”*

First, we show that investors with regular short-term gains from their other investments are likely to derive the biggest benefit from direct indexing. (We present evidence that such investors might be predominantly high-net-worth investors with allocations to hedge funds and derivatives). How much lower is the tax benefit for investors with only long-term gains? Let’s start with the left-most chart in Figure 1,<sup>2</sup> which is based on historical simulations of a direct indexing strategy. For investors who don’t regularly add capital to the strategy, the difference in tax benefit between having short-term gains (purple line) and having only long-term gains (green line) from other investments is 2% in the first year!

*“After approximately five to six years, the presence of regular short-term gains can make a difference between a positive tax benefit and a small tax liability”*

Second, as time progresses, after approximately five to six years, the presence of regular short-term gains can make a difference between a positive tax benefit and a small tax *liability*.<sup>3</sup> While many investors familiar with direct indexing strategies expect their tax benefits to decay over time and to be generally lower in the absence of short-term gains from other investments, Figure 1 shows just how striking the impact is.

The last issue we tackle in the paper is the impact of the Biden Plan’s proposed higher tax rates on long-term capital gains and elimination of the step-up in cost basis upon death. We use a tax rate of 43.4% (the tax rate proposed under the Biden Tax Plan for the top income bracket) for all capital gains. Sticking with the left-most chart in Figure 1, the Biden Tax Plan (red line) makes all investors look more like investors who only have long-term capital gains under the current tax regime. This makes sense: under the proposed plan, high-income investors would no longer benefit from the difference between short-term and long-term capital gains tax rates—for them the two rates will

be equal.

Finally, we show how investors might be able to do better in terms of their tax benefits: 1) by contributing capital over time or, 2) by combining the strategy with a charitable giving program.<sup>4</sup> Regularly contributing capital to a direct indexing strategy (the middle chart) can increase the tax benefit in later years to positive territory, even for investors with only long-term capital gains from other investments. Incorporating a charitable giving program (the right-most chart) provides a meaningful bump to all investors and in all tax regimes, but especially under the Biden Tax Plan, where the build-up of unrealized gains, which results from systematic gain deferral, becomes materially less punitive because investors are able to donate appreciated positions.

Figure 1. Active Tax Benefit under Different Capital Flow and Tax Rate Assumptions



Source: XPressFeed, S&P, MSCI Barra. We run 45 separate strategy simulations starting in January of every year from 1975 to 2019 and all ending in December 2019. Each month, we minimize both tax costs and transaction costs, subject to staying within a 1% tracking error (computed using the MSCI Barra risk model) to the S&P 500. Transaction costs are computed as a function of VIX, the risk of the stock, and the amount traded relative to the stock's trading volume. For tax costs, short-term losses are rewarded more than long-term losses and short-term gains are penalized more than long-term gains. We modeled two alternative tax rate assumptions: the 2020 tax rate regime and the proposed Biden Tax Plan regime. Under the 2020 tax rate regime, the tax rate on short-term capital gains was assumed to be 40.8%, and the tax rate on both long-term capital gains and dividend income was assumed to be 23.8%. Under the Biden Tax Plan all the gains and dividends are assumed to be taxed at a uniform rate of 43.4%. When reporting tax benefits, we calculate this separately for an investor who can use short-term capital losses to offset short-term capital gains ("Offset STCG" line) and an investor who uses short-term capital losses to offset long-term capital gains ("Offset LTCG" line). Tax benefit under the proposed Biden tax Plan are shown by the line "Biden Tax Plan." We account for unrealized capital gains by computing an effective tax rate reflecting expected present value of future tax liabilities. We use the effective tax rates of 10%, 25%, 5%, and 10% for 2020 Tax Rates, Biden Tax Rate, 2020 Tax Rates with Charitable Giving, Biden Tax Rate with Charitable Giving, respectively. Finally, all tax benefits are computed relative to a benchmark, which is modeled as a direct holding in a passive ETF which distributes dividend income but does not generate any capital gains. Hypothetical performance results have many inherent limitations, some of which, but not all, are described herein. No representation is being made that any fund or account will or is likely to achieve profits or losses similar to those shown herein. Hypothetical performance results are presented for illustrative purposes only. Hypothetical performance is gross of advisory fees, net of transaction costs, and includes the reinvestment of dividends. If the expenses were reflected, the performance shown would be lower.

[1] For high-income taxpayers, the Biden administration proposed to increase the highest bracket tax rate, tax long-term capital gains at the same rate as short-term capital gains, eliminate the step-up in cost basis upon death for assets passing through estate, and even tax all the unrealized gains upon death if the asset is not donated to charity.

[2] Figure 1 presents the same data as Figure 1 in the paper.

[3] A direct indexing strategy builds up unrealized gains due to the deferral of gains in earlier years. While this is generally beneficial for an investor, a consequence is that after a few years, rebalancing the strategy (e.g., to stay within a certain tracking error of the index) may cause the strategy to realize more gains than losses and result in a tax liability rather than a tax benefit.

[4] By combining the strategy with a charitable giving program an investor donates the most appreciated positions to charity and replaces them with new capital.

#### Disclosures

This document has been provided to you solely for information purposes and does not constitute an offer or solicitation of an offer or any advice or recommendation to purchase any securities or other financial instruments and may not be construed as such. The factual information set forth herein has been obtained or derived from sources believed by the author and AQR Capital Management, LLC ("AQR") to be reliable but it is not necessarily all-inclusive and is not guaranteed as to its accuracy and is not to be regarded as a representation or warranty, express or implied, as to the information's accuracy or completeness, nor should the attached information serve as the basis of any investment decision. This document is intended exclusively for the use of the person to whom it has been delivered by AQR, and it is not to be reproduced or redistributed to any other person. The information set forth herein has been provided to you as secondary information and should not be the primary source for any investment or allocation decision. Past performance is not a guarantee of future performance.

This material is not research and should not be treated as research. This paper does not represent valuation judgments with respect to any financial instrument, issuer, security or sector that may be described or referenced herein and does not represent a formal or official view of AQR. The views expressed reflect the current views as of the date hereof and neither the author nor AQR undertakes to advise you of any changes in the views expressed herein.

The information contained herein is only as current as of the date indicated, and may be superseded by subsequent market events or for other reasons. Charts and graphs provided herein are for illustrative purposes only. The information in this presentation has been developed internally and/or obtained from sources believed to be reliable; however, neither AQR nor the author guarantees the accuracy, adequacy or completeness of such information. Nothing contained herein constitutes investment, legal, tax or other advice nor is it to be relied on in making an investment or other decision. There can be no assurance that an investment strategy will be successful. Historic market trends are not reliable indicators of actual future market behavior or future performance of any particular investment which may differ materially, and should not be relied upon as such.

The information in this paper may contain projections or other forward-looking statements regarding future events, targets, forecasts or expectations regarding the strategies described herein, and is only current as of the date indicated. There is no assurance that such events or targets will be achieved, and may be significantly different from that shown here. The information in this document, including statements concerning financial market trends, is based on current market conditions, which will fluctuate and may be superseded by subsequent market events or for other reasons.

HYPOTHETICAL PERFORMANCE RESULTS HAVE MANY INHERENT LIMITATIONS, SOME OF WHICH, BUT NOT ALL, ARE DESCRIBED HEREIN. NO REPRESENTATION IS BEING MADE THAT ANY FUND OR ACCOUNT WILL OR IS LIKELY TO ACHIEVE PROFITS OR LOSSES SIMILAR TO THOSE SHOWN HEREIN. IN FACT, THERE ARE FREQUENTLY SHARP DIFFERENCES BETWEEN HYPOTHETICAL PERFORMANCE RESULTS AND THE ACTUAL RESULTS SUBSEQUENTLY REALIZED BY ANY PARTICULAR TRADING PROGRAM. ONE OF THE LIMITATIONS OF HYPOTHETICAL PERFORMANCE RESULTS IS THAT THEY ARE GENERALLY PREPARED WITH THE BENEFIT OF HINDSIGHT. IN ADDITION, HYPOTHETICAL TRADING DOES NOT INVOLVE FINANCIAL RISK, AND NO HYPOTHETICAL TRADING RECORD CAN COMPLETELY ACCOUNT FOR THE IMPACT OF FINANCIAL RISK IN ACTUAL TRADING. FOR EXAMPLE, THE ABILITY TO WITHSTAND LOSSES OR TO ADHERE TO A PARTICULAR TRADING PROGRAM IN SPITE OF TRADING LOSSES ARE MATERIAL POINTS THAT CAN ADVERSELY AFFECT ACTUAL TRADING RESULTS. THERE ARE NUMEROUS OTHER FACTORS RELATED TO THE MARKETS IN GENERAL OR TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ANY SPECIFIC TRADING PROGRAM WHICH CANNOT BE FULLY ACCOUNTED FOR IN THE PREPARATION OF HYPOTHETICAL PERFORMANCE RESULTS, ALL OF WHICH CAN ADVERSELY AFFECT ACTUAL TRADING RESULTS.